TEMPLATE 1 – GAP ANALYSIS

Name Organisation under review: UNIVERSITY OF NAVARRA

Organisation's contact details: Pablo Goñi – pgoni@unav.es

SUBMISSION DATE: MAY 18TH, 2020

DATE ENDORSEMENT CHARTER AND CODE: 15/02/2018

Please provide the date when your organisation officially endorsed the European Charter for Researchers and the Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers.

The University of Navarra began its involvement in the *HR Excellence in Research* project at the end of November 2017, after attending an Info Day in Brussels, *"The Human Resources Strategy for Researchers and how to comply with article 32 of the H2020 Grant Agreement".* After evaluating the information and analyzing the positive effects that might result from the project, an important commitment was made:

• The signing of the European Charter and Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers, by the Rector, February 15th, 2018.

These events initiated the development and direction of the project via the Human Resources service of the University of Navarra, under the direction of University's Vice-Rector for Research.

Beginning of 2018, the Vice-Rector for Research, Iciar Astiasarán, presented the project to Board of Directors. Following the recommendations of the European Commission, the **STEERING COMMITTEE** (SC) of the *HR Excellence in Research* project was created in February, 2018 whose sole aim was to work on an institutional analysis in order to bring the University of Navarra into line with the principles of the C&C. In order to safeguard the execution of the Implementation Phase, an **IMPLEMEMTATION COMMITTEE** (IC) was named by the SC as an executive and hands-on body responsible for the overall preparation and coordination of the Gap Analysis and the Action Plan.

The main objective of the SC and IC at this phase was to set the guidelines of the process at the strategic level and approve the methodological approach. The need to involve the entire Research and Faculty Community was immediately detected and a General Assembly was announced in March 2018 by the SC. Associate Deans of Research of all Faculties and Research Centers were convened to a briefing of the HSR4R process and the need to create a homogenous working group was defined. Associate Deans of Research were asked to actively take part in the Working Group and nominate a further 3 aspirants (R1 to R3) from their give Faculty.

In April 2018, the **WORKING GROUP** (WP) was consolidated and brought forward in a Kick Off meeting held for all Research and Faculty Community end of April 2018. The SC and IC presented the four main focuses of the GAP Analysis (Professional and Ethical aspects; Recruitment; Working condition and Social Security; Access to research training and continuous development) and set forward the time frame of a comprehensive internal analysis of all C&C principles. The Gap Analysis was to be carried out by the WG and in order to involve a wider spectrum of the research community an internal Survey was to be implemented.

GAP ANALYSIS

The Charter and Code provides the basis for the Gap analysis. In order to aid cohesion, the 40 articles have been renumbered under the following headings. Please provide the outcome of your organisation's GAP analysis below. If your organisation currently does not fully meet the criteria, please list whether national or organisational legislation may be limiting the Charter's implementation, initiatives that have already been taken to improve the situation or new proposals that could remedy the current situation. In order to help the organisation's recruitment strategy, a specific self-assessment checklist is provided for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment.

European Charte	European Charter for Researchers and Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers : GAP analysis overview			
Status: to what extent does this organisation meet the following principles?	implemented	In case of -, -/+, or +/-, please indicate the actual "gap " between the principle and the current practice in your organisation. If relevant, please list any national/regional legislation or organisational regulation currently impeding implementation	Initiatives already undertaken and/or suggestions for improvement	
Ethical and Profess	ional Aspects			
1. Research freedom	+	NO GAP DETECTED	Fully Implemented. Initiatives already undertaken:	
		 Relevant Legislation: -Spanish Law 14/2011 on Science, Technology and Innovation Institutional Rules: -Code of good scientific practice -Code of good practice in clinical research and the laboratory and animal experimentation -Code of good research practice at the Doctoral School 	 Existence of a Research Ethics Committee, guaranteeing freedom at the same time as solving problems and warning on ethical limits according to circumstances. Evidence: Information from the CEI on the website <u>https://www.unav.edu/web/investigacion/comite-de-etica-de-la-investigacion1</u> Ethics Committee for Animal Experimentation <u>http://www.unav.es/ceea/</u> UNAV's code of good research practice that discusses the freedom of research and its limitations. Evidence: Information on the Doctoral School website on the code of good practice in research: 	

			https://edit.unav.edu/documents/11310/559537/Calendario+actividades+1920.pdf/efcc4206-6c84-aee2-fbc8-312719e8846d? ga=2.86484632.1802315776.1570426629-1526115667.15699373173. Diversity of research groups, guaranteeing freedom of choicefor research topics. There are currently over 106 registeredresearch groups within UNAV. Evidence:-Research group websites:https://www.unav.edu/web/investigacion/investigadores/grupos-de-investigacion4. Subject-based map of the research from University of Navarrais available on the University's web:https://www.unav.edu/en/web/biblioteca/unidad-bibliometria/mapa-tematico
2. Ethical principles	+	NO GAP DETECTED	Fully Implemented. Initiatives already undertaken:
		 Relevant Legislation: Spanish Law 14/2011 on Science, Technology and Innovation. Spanish Law 14/2007, on research into Biomedicine. Spanish Law 2016/679 on Personal Data Protection. Spanish Law 1201/2005 on Animal Protection in Experimentation. 	 The Ethical Research Committee (CEI) oversees the monitoring and compliance of ethical norms and core ethical principles. Approved Guidelines and Methodology procedures are available on the web portal: <u>https://www.unav.edu/web/investigacion/comite-de-etica-de-la- investigacion1</u> -Ethics Committee for Animal Experimentation <u>http://www.unav.es/ceea/</u> <u>Institutional declaration on the use of experimental animals</u>

			 3. University of Navarra is certified in <u>Good laboratory practices</u> (GLP) by the Spanish Ministry of Health 4. The University and University Clinic respectively counts with two certified Data Protection Officers responsible for overseeing the data protection strategy and its implementation to ensure compliance with GDPR requirements: <u>https://www.unav.edu/en/proteccion-de-datos#proteccion2</u> <u>https://www.cun.es/en/terms-conditions/protection-policy</u>
3. Professional responsibility	+/-	GAP detected by the working group: -There is an internal regulation governing this aspect: "Regulation of the Research Ethics Committee" and the "The University of Navarra's mission statement". However it is considered appropriate to strengthen these aspects. Collect the different sources of the regulations in an online document, updatable and available to all researchers in order to help them and guide them in the field of Professional Responsibility.	Partially Implemented: - UNAV has a norm covering intellectual and industrial property and a special UNIT at the Technology Transfer Office supporting IP issue. The Head of the department is also a Senior IP advisor at the European IP Helpdesk Intellectual and Industrial Protection at UNAV: https://www.unav.edu/en/web/investigacion/proteccion-y- promocion-de-resultados http://www.iprhelpdesk.eu/ambassadorsteam#spain - Doctoral School annual training program offers all its students a 2 day seminar on IPR issues: https://www.unav.edu/en/web/estudios/escuela-de-doctorado - Seminar offered to all staff on Clinical Good Practices: https://www.cun.es/docencia/formacion-continuada/cursos- formacion-online/buenas-practicas-clinicas-investigacion

			 Recommendations made by the working group: 1. Development of "Handbook of good practices" 2. Collect the different sources of the regulations in an online document, updatable and available to all researchers in order to help them and guide them in the field of Professional Responsibility.
4. Professional attitude	+/-	GAP detected by the working group: Although covered, it has been detected that the Research community at UNAV not always knows where to seek support or is fully aware of all services available to them. In order to solve this GAP, a Researcher's Hands On Manual and Promotional video has been proposed. A hands-on manual, designed to help researchers manage the different services and resources available to them, within UNAV.	 Partially Implemented The Research Management Unit provides updated information regarding the importance of such issues and provides assistance in regional, national, European and international competitive calls. Research projects that include ethical issues, such as biological samples of human origin and data protection, or animal testing, need prior approval of the Ethical Research Committee (CEI): https://www.unav.edu/web/investigacion/comite-de-etica-de-la-investigacion1 The Technology Transfer UNIT at UNAV supports researchers in the process of negotiation of technology transfer agreements with private companies and industry: https://www.unav.edu/en/web/investigacion/servicios-para-empresas/tipos-de-colaboracion The International Project Management Unit at UNAV, assist researchers in the process of participation in R&D international Programs (detection and promotion of calls; adapting idea to project structure; grant agreement negotiation and project management): https://www.unav.edu/en/web/investigacion/internacional

			 In addition, the IPM unit also organizes training sessions concerning R&D European programs, especially <u>H2020</u>. Recommendations made by the working group: Researcher's Hands On Manual and Promotional video Incorporate information on UNAV's project management support in the Welcome Manual for Researchers
5. Contractual and legal obligations	+/-	GAP detected by the working group: There are different internal and external regulations in matters of legal and contractual obligations. However, the need to make them accessible to all researchers, including their translation into English, is considered a priority. It has been detected that sometimes the information is difficult to locate and is not fully translated into English. A Handbook on Good Practices has been proposed, incorporating all useful information for researchers. This handbook should be easily located in UNAV's web section and also distributed as part of the Welcome Package to new recruits.	 Intelectual and Industrial Property standards and procedures. <u>https://www.unav.edu/en/web/investigacion/proteccion-y-promocion-de-resultados</u> Doctoral School annual training program offers a 2 day seminar on IPR issues: <u>https://www.unav.edu/en/web/estudios/escuela-de-doctorado</u> Innovation Factory at UNAV fosters the exploitation of R&D results congregated at the University by the design of innovation and technology commercialization initiatives or business creation. <u>https://www.unav.edu/web/innovation-factory/inicio</u>

			Scientific Culture Office, and International Project Management Unit etc By intensifying dissemination and facilitating web based enrolment.
6. Accountability	+/-	GAP detected by the working group:	Partially Implemented:
		Although a clear policy on spending, financial procedures and management criteria exists, these should be gathered in the Handbook on Good Practices in a clear and concise manor for easy access to the research community. Research community should be clear on their obligations of a good research practice.	 In-house software for Project Management (FUNDANET) for the eclusive use of project managers. In-house interactive financial dashboard for the use of reseachers (Oracle Business Inteligence). This dashboards offers researchers an up to date view of all their active research projects with a detailed outlook on expenditure and outstanding balance. This dashboards also offers expenditure guidlines. Research Management Unit controls the financial reporting of research projects and all costs incurred require previous approval by the Unit.
			 Recommendations made by the working group: Research Management Unit offers regular training sessions on regional/ national /european project management. These training courses are published internaly through mailchimp, however they could be additionally made available through the <u>Research Mangement Unit's</u> website. New recruited researchers should be made familiar with internal existing processes on how to incur cost for public funding.
7. Good practice in research	+/-	GAP detected by the working group:	Partially Implemented:
		Despite existing a large number of internal regulations governing this aspect, it has been	- Research projects that include ethical issues in their progress, such as biological samples, data protection or animal testing,

		detected that the information is scattered and not readily available to the research community as a whole. It has been recommended that the working groups merges together all internal regulations available, update when needed, in order to incorporate the information in the Welcome Package for Researchers and the Handbook on Good Practices.	should be approved by UNAV's ethical committees: https://www.unav.edu/web/investigacion/comite-de-etica-de-la- investigacion1 http://www.unav.es/ceea/ - UNAV counts with an Occupational Risks Prevention Service with a clear risk prevention policy, available to all researchers in the Intranet. - IT Risk management: IT service at UNAV count with different data storage units available for researchers where several data recovery and back-up measures are taken. -UNAV and University Clinic respectively count with two certified Data Protection Officers responsible for overseeing the data protection strategy and its implementation to ensure compliance with GDPR requirements: https://www.unav.edu/en/proteccion-de-datos#proteccion2 https://www.cun.es/en/terms-conditions/protection-policy Recommendations made by the working group: -Incorporate information and links on security in the workplace in the "Welcome Manual for Researchers". -Include within the "Handbook of good practices" sections related to: Prevention of Occupational Risks, Intellectual Property, Data Management and Professional Responsibility.
8. Dissemination, exploitation of	+/-	GAP detected by the working group:	Partially Implemented:
results		The necessary tools are available, however they need to be better communicated within the research community and kept updated through hands on seminars on an annual basis.	- UNAV counts with an Open Access Institutional Repository, <u>DADUN</u> , which collects preserves and disseminates papers reflecting academic and scientific activity at the University of Navarra. (It has been recently named 7 th in Spain in the <u>Ranking</u>

		These tools should also be clearly depicted in the Welcome Package for Researchers and the Handbook on Good Practices.	 Web of Repositories. UNAV counts with a <u>Bibliometrics Units</u> who advises researchers on the different stages in the publication process. The unit also offers practical training courses, including Open Access Policies. All manuals and guides are easily accessible on the web: <u>https://www.unav.edu/en/web/biblioteca/unidad-bibliometria/apoyo-publicacion</u> UNAV counts with a <u>Technology Transfer Unit</u> that supports researchers in the process of exploitation of results. The unit also offers <u>courses</u> on a regular basis, available to all researchers and safeguards an easy access to useful guidelines in its web: <u>https://www.unav.edu/documents/11314/16826368/EU-IPR-IP-Guide.pdf/</u> Innovation Factory: A transversal project that aims to promote an entrepreneurial University that generates wealth and employment for our graduates and for society, contributing to the consolidation of an ecosystem capable of attracting the best talent.
			 Recommendations made by the working group: Include in the "Handbook of good practices" aspects related to: 1) Definition, planning and prevention of commercial use. 2) Definition and control of information for communication purposes and obligations in terms of preserving the interests of the University. Training seminars (yearly) on making use of results so that they can be exploited commercially
9. Public engagement	+/-	GAP detected by the working group:	Partially Implemented:

		The annual report of the University includes in its Research section an overview of the institutional research activity.	 - UNAV counts with a <u>Science Dissemination Unit</u> in order to help researchers spread their research and results amongst society and improve public's understanding of their science. - UNAV counts with scientific dissemination activities such as <u>newsletters</u> - <u>Science Museum</u> - <u>University Museum of Contemporary Art</u> Recommendations made by the working group: Conduct a review of institutional communications in relation to research. Evaluate if all channels available are being used and how they can be enhanced.
10. Non discrimination	+	Relevant Legislation: -Spanish Law (14/2011) on Science, Technology and Innovation	Fully Implemented. - The University of Navarra counts with a Gender Conciliation and Equality Plan, embedded in its DNA. The plan is easily accessible to faculty and research community within the <u>UNAV INTRANET</u> . Nonetheless general information is accessible <u>here</u> . -The <u>Disability Support Unit (UAPD</u>), is a body overseen by the Office of the Vice-President for Students. It aims to guarantee access and inclusion under equal conditions of all students.
11. Evaluation/ appraisal systems	+		Fully Implemented. Professional Development Program: there is an internal indicators based system to monitor and evaluate research performance of Research Groups annually, accessible to the entire research community on the University's Intranet

Recruitment and Selection – please be aware that the items listed here correspond with the Charter and Code. In addition, your organisation also needs to complete the checklist on **Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment** included below, which focuses on the operationalization of these

	principles.			
12. Recruitment	+/-	GAP detected by the working group:	Partially Implemented:	
		There is a "Recruitment Procedure", as well as orientation sessions for the new recruits. However, it is necessary to review and update the Procedure for Recruitment, Selection and Hiring taking into account the principles established in the OTM-R. It has also been detected that a centralised unit for foreign incoming researchers is need, offering continuous assistance in order to ensure their correct integration.	 UNAV counts with a Recruitment procedure as well as orientation sessions for new recruits. All this information can be found under the intranet section In addition, the University of Navarra has a <u>Professional Development Program for Researchers</u> and a Competencies Manual that provides evaluators with criteria and standards for evaluation. Recommendations made by the working group: Create a centralised unit for the welcoming and continuous assistance of foreign incoming researchers. User friendly website for foreign researchers. Review and update the "Recruitment, Selection and Hiring Procedure". Taking into account the principles established in the OTM-R. 	
13. Recruitment (Code)	+/-	GAP detected by the working group: Despite the Recruitment Procedure in place at UNAV, it has been detected that there exists a lack of knowledge in job offers/vacancies within the research community.	Partially Implemented: UNAV counts with a Recruitment procedure, found under the intranet section of the HR Department Recommendations made by the working group: -Review and update the "Recruitment, Selection and Hiring Procedure". Taking into account the principles established in the OTM-R. -Improve website in order to make job offers more visible, with concise indications of appointment requirements.	

			-Increase publication of job offers in EURAXESS.
14. Selection (Code)	+/-	GAP detected by the working group:	Partially Implemented.
		Although there is a "Recruitment Procedure" according to which each application is approved by a minimum of six stakeholders, the procedure does not clearly state the process for recruitment and selection of the candidates.	Recommendations made by the working group: Update the "Recruitment, Selection and Hiring Procedure". Include the evaluation criteria and define the advertisement procedure for each vacancy as well as the procedure for assessing the applications.
15. Transparency	+/-	GAP detected by the working group:	Partially Implemented:
(Code)		There are no guidelines or criteria for advertising the vacancies and requirements of the position offered.	Recommendations made by the working group: Update the "Recruitment, Selection and Hiring Procedure" including a section explaining the procedure to be followed for advertising job vacancies. Publish the procedure for selection and assessment of the applications. These should be published on the institutional website.
16. Judging merit	+	NO GAP DETECTED	Fully Implemented:
(Code)		Institutional Processes:- Professional Development Program- Recruitment Processes- Bibliometrics Unit- Academic Staff Regulations- ANECA (The National Agency for QualityAssessment and Accreditation of Spain) - UNAVagreement for the evaluation of research	The University of Navarra's selection process generally involves two or three persons: Principal Researcher, Department Director and HR Manager. Throughout the interviews, technical and quantitative aspects are evaluated, but at the same time the professional competencies of the candidates are assessed and evaluated. In order to safeguard unified criterion for interviewers, there is a Dictionary of Competences and a Selection Decalogue available for the selection process.

		activity.	
17. Variations in the chronological order of CVs (Code)	+	 NO GAP DETECTED Institutional Processes: XIII Collective agreement of university and research centres. Spanish Law 8/2015 Professional Development Program Recruitment Processes Bibliometrics Unit Academic Staff Regulations Reconciliation and Equality Plan of the University of Navarra. 	Fully Implemented: The University of Navarra ensures evaluation criteria based on merit. It also has embedded in its identity, an equality and conciliation program. Professional advice is also offered before, during and after maternity and paternity leave periods.
18. Recognition of mobility experience (Code)	+	 NO GAP DETECTED Institutional Processes: <u>UNAV's Scholarships and Mobility grants.</u> <u>Social Security regulations for travels abroad.</u> UNAV's Internal Travel Procedures. 	Fully Implemented: The university recognizes and supports the international mobility of its researchers. At the beginning of the research career (pre-doctoral), it offers PhD programs with international mention. It also offers its employees scholarships and mobility assistance. It also supports researchers in all the necessary steps and coverage for their stays.
19. Recognition of qualifications (Code)	+	 NO GAP DETECTED Institutional Processes: Spanish Law 1002/2010, on the issue of official university degrees. Spanish Law 967/2014, establishing the requirements and procedures for the 	Fully Implemented: The University of Navarra establishes minimum requirements for each category, among which are the degree of training and the specialist for the correct performance of the function. The University of Navarra relies on Spanish legislation regarding official degrees. Likewise, international degrees are recognized

		recognition and declaration of equivalence to official university gualifications and for the validation of foreign higher education studies.	for the recruitment of research staff.
20. Seniority (Code)	+	NO GAP DETECTED Institutional Processes: - Professional Development Program - Recruitment Processes - Bibliometrics Unit - Academic Staff Regulations	Fully Implemented: The University of Navarra has a Professional Development Program which establishes criteria for the incorporation into the different Research categories (both for technicians and support services). In addition, this Program identifies, according to levels, the requirements for access, functions and responsibilities. The University of Navarra also has a Professional Development Program for Researchers in which evaluation criteria are established based on merit.
21. Postdoctoral appointments (Code)	+	NO GAP DETECTED Institutional Processes: - Professional Development Program - Recruitment Processes - Bibliometrics Unit - Academic Staff Regulations - XIII Collective agreement of university and research centres.	Fully Implemented: The University of Navarra has a Research Professional Development Programme. This Programme establishes evaluation criteria within the research career. It also establishes the categories and criteria for post-doctoral levels.
		Working Conditions and Soc	ial Security
22. Recognition	+	NO GAP DETECTED	Fully Implemented:

of the profession		 LEGISLATION: Spanish Law 14/2011 on Science, Technology and Innovation. Organic Law 4/2007, on Universities National regulation 2/2015, on Workers' Statute. XIII Collective agreement of university and research centres. Directive 2013/55/UE of the European Parliament and Council, November 20th 2013 Institutional Processes: Professional Development Program Recruitment Processes 	The University of Navarra has systems for the recognition and development of professional careers according to whether they are: Administration and Services Personnel, and Research Personnel, as well as Pre-doctoral Research Personnel in Training. For Administration and Services Personnel, the University of Navarra has a Professional Development Programme (available in the employee portal). Likewise, for Research Personnel, the University of Navarra has a Professional Development Programme for Researchers (PDPI). The process, procedure and criteria for access to the Programme and the Development within it are public on the web (https://www.unav.edu/web/investigacion/evaluacion-de-la-investigacion-profesores-pdpi-sexenios). For pre-doctoral staff, the university has a Doctorate Programme which offers specific training for their own development at the start of their research careers (https://www.unav.edu/web/investigacion/personal-investigador-en-formacion-pif). Likewise, the Doctoral School is in charge of coordinating, planning and monitoring the University's doctoral
23. Research environment	+	NO GAP DETECTED NATIONAL LEGISLATION: - National regulation 2/2015, on Workers' Statute. - Law 31/1995 on the prevention of occupational hazards	 (https://www.unav.edu/web/estudios/escuela-de-doctorado). Fully Implemented: The University of Navarra has procedures and protocols in place in order to safeguard a working environment for researchers, access to training and adequate facilities and tools to carry out his/her work. Thus, the Occupational Risk Prevention Service ensures the health and safety of all the people who work in its facilities and the compliance with Law 31/1995 on Occupational

		 Institutional processes: Core Values of the University of Navarra. Statutes of the University of Navarra Professional Development Program Regulation Emergency Plan Occupational Risk Prevention Service PIUNA. Thematic Research Map 	 Risk Prevention (and Law 54/2003 that complements the previous one). The <u>HR Department</u> offers training courses for employees of the University of Navarra. In addition, the <u>Research Management Service</u> offers researchers resources, tools and opportunities for collaboration with national and international research networks, as well as in the field of private enterprise. For its part, the Technical Secretariat for Research publicises and manages the <u>PIUNA</u>, internal researcher funds dedicated to fund projects in their initial funds which cannot obtain external public or private funading. On the other hand, the Works and Facilities Services, Maintenance Service and Computer Services ensure that university employees have the appropriate facilities and tools for the development of their work. The University of Navarra counts wiith a <u>Thematic Research Map</u>
24. Working conditions	+	NATIONAL LEGISLATION:	Fully Implemented:
		R.D 2/2015 (Estatuto de los trabajadores)Ley 14/2012 (Ley de la CienciaR.D. 103/2019 Estatuto del PersonalPredoctoralR.D. 8/2015 Ley General de la Seguridad SocialXIII Convenio Colectivo de Centros	The University of Navarra applies Spanish legislation in situations of maternity, paternity, reductions in working hours and leave of absence to care for family members (R.D. 2/2015 and Royal Legislative Decree 8/2015 and 13th Collective Agreement of University and Research Centres).
		Universitarios e Investigación	The University of Navarra also has an Equality and Conciliation

		Institutional processes:	Plan in place (https://www.unav.edu/web/horizonte- 2020/conciliacion-e-igualdad)
		Plan de Igualdad y Conciliación Universidad de Navarra (https://www.unav.edu/web/horizonte- 2020/conciliacion-e-igualdad)	In addition, the University of Navarra provides financial aid for children, a flexible working day plan so that its employees can reconcile family and professional life, and in the summer months it offers activities for employees' children during the holiday period.
			The University of Navarra complies with the provisions of Organic Law 3/2007, of 22 March, for the effective equality of women and men.
			Work is currently underway on the Equality Plan in order to comply with the provisions of Royal Decree 6/2019, urgent measures to guarantee equal treatment and opportunities between women and men in employment and occupation.
25. Stability and	+	NATIONAL LEGISLATION:	Fully Implemented:
permanence of employment		R.D 2/2015 (Workers' Statute) Ley 14/2012 (Ley de la Ciencia) R.D. 103/2019 R.D. 8/2015 XIII Convenio Colectivo de Centros Universitarios e Investigación Institutional processes:	The University of Navarra has systems for the recognition and development of professional careers according to whether they are: Administration and Services Personnel, and Research Personnel, as well as Pre-doctoral Research Personnel in Training. For Administration and Services Personnel, the University of Navarra has a Professional Development Programme (available in the employee portal, it should be published and the website indicated). Likewise, for Research Staff, the University of Navarra has a Professional Development Programme for Researchers

		-Professional Development Program Regulation	Programme and the Development within it are public on the website. For pre-doctoral staff, the university has a Doctorate Programme which offers specific training for their own development at the start of their research careers. Likewise, the Doctoral School is in charge of coordinating, planning and following up on the University's doctoral programs
			In this sense, the University of Navarra is guided by the following criteria: 1) National regulations on labour matters, 2) Funds for stability and maintenance of employment, 3) A clear orientation to the preservation and stability of the employment of its staff, either permanent or temporary. There is an evaluation procedure for the recruitment of permanent staff in the university. However, it should be updated and included in a written document describing the steps and criteria to follow.
			Proposal for improvement:
			In the "Recruitment, Selection and Hiring Process" the measures of the University of Navarra for "stable and permanent employment" must be mentioned.
26. Funding and salaries	+	LEGISLATION:	Fully Implemented:
		 XIII Convenio Colectivo de Centros Universitarios e Investigación 	The University of Navarre has salary tables for all its Administrative and Services staff, Teaching staff and Research staff. The salary tables are established according to categories,
		Institutional processes:	and are based on functions and responsibilities. It is worth noting that university salary tables are well above the basic national
		- The salary tables.	minimum. The basic rule governing the University of Navarra for

			-Professional Development Program Regulation - Social benefits can only be accessed from the employee portal.	establishing salaries is the 13th Collective Agreement for University and Research Centers. The salary tables are significantly higher than those established in the Collective Agreement. In addition, the University of Navarra offers its employees social benefits, including: family aid per child, birth grants, marriage grants, bonuses for studies offered by the University of Navarra and significant discounts for the spouses of employees, and ACUNSA medical insurance. In addition, during periods of sick leave or accident, the University of Navarra supplements the employee's salary by up to 100% and continues to contribute to the Social Security during the entire period of sick leave or accident. During maternity and paternity leave the Spanish Social Security pays the employee's salary, in the event that the Social Security does not cover the total salary the university complements up to 100% of the employee's gross salary. Likewise, the University of Navarra complies with the provisions of the Social Security in terms of contributions, paying 23.6% of the salary for common contingencies, 5.50% for unemployment, 0.50% for the Wage Guarantee Fund, 0.60% for Professional Training and 1% for Temporary Incapacity, Disability, Death or Survival. All this applies to all employees of the University of Navarra and in proportion to their dedication.
27. balance	Gender	+	LEGISLATION:	Fully Implemented:
			 <u>Constitución española.</u> <u>Ideario universidad de Navarra</u> <u>Ley Orgánica 3/2007, de 22 de marzo,</u> para la igualdad - efectiva de mujeres y 	The University of Navarra is committed to gender balance and non-discrimination. So much so that the University of Navarra has an Equality Plan. Furthermore, the selective processes are carried out openly and without discrimination by gender, in the

		 <u>hombres.</u> R.D 6/2019, medidas urgentes para garantía de la igualdad de trato y de oportunidades entre mujeres y hombres en el empleo y la ocupación 	knowledge that balance is good for the university itself. So much so that currently 53% of staff are women and 47% men. In the group of Directors 57% are men and 43% are women. In the Research Staff, 44% are women and 56% men.
		 Institutional processes: Plan de Igualdad y Conciliación de la universidad de Navarra. Annual Reports universidad de Navarra 	The University of Navarra complies with the provisions of Organic Law 3/2007, of 22 March, for the effective equality of women and men. Work is currently underway on the Equality Plan in order to
			comply with the provisions of Royal Decree 6/2019, urgent measures to guarantee equal treatment and opportunities between women and men in employment and occupation.
28. Career	+/-	LEGISLACIÓN	+/- almost but not fully implemented
development	+/-	 R.D. 2/2015 Estatuto de los trabajadores Ley 14/2011 de la Ciencia 	+/- almost but not fully implemented For the first stages of the professional career, specifically for the Predoctoral Staff, the Doctoral School offers specific training for this stage of the research career.
	+/-	 R.D. 2/2015 Estatuto de los trabajadores 	For the first stages of the professional career, specifically for the Predoctoral Staff, the Doctoral School offers specific training for
	+/-	 R.D. 2/2015 Estatuto de los trabajadores Ley 14/2011 de la Ciencia R.D. 103/2019 Estatuto del Personal 	For the first stages of the professional career, specifically for the Predoctoral Staff, the Doctoral School offers specific training for this stage of the research career.
	+/-	 R.D. 2/2015 Estatuto de los trabajadores Ley 14/2011 de la Ciencia R.D. 103/2019 Estatuto del Personal Predoctoral. 	For the first stages of the professional career, specifically for the Predoctoral Staff, the Doctoral School offers specific training for this stage of the research career. The Bibliometrics Unit offers career counselling services. In addition, all employees are assigned a Mentor. This is a senior

			 Mentoring procedure. Training plan. A "Mentoring Procedure" will be developed. Likewise, a "Training Plan" will be created for researchers, covering the main areas of career development of the researcher. There is no specific Training Plan for the researcher's career. Training is offered in specific topics and areas, but there is no overall, planned training strategy for each stage of the researcher's career. The figure of the mentor exists but it is not focused on research staff.
29. Value of	+	LEGISLATION:	Fully implemented
mobility		 Ley 14/2011, de la Ciencia, Tecnología e Innovación R.D. 103/2019 Estatuto del Personal Predoctoral. XIII Convenio Colectivo de Centros Universitarios e Investigación Normativa española en materia de seguridad social sobre desplazamientos Institutional processes: The salary tables. Programa de Desarrollo Profesional Investigadores. Programa de Desarrollo Profesional Concessional de Desarrollo Profesional Concessional Concessi	 The University of Navarra has a Mobility Plan that takes the form of a programme of aid for international mobility (Mobility Grants). In addition, in the initial stage of the research career, Predoctoral, the mention of International Doctorate is promoted, and each time Predoctoral employees opt for this mention. In addition, within the Professional Development Program for Researchers, it is a requirement for access, in the post-doctoral stages, to carry out research stays in international institutions for a minimum of one year. In addition, the University of Navarra offers its employees support for stays and international mobility. Specifically, communication with the Social Security for travel,

		 <u>Servicio de Gestión de la Investigación</u> <u>Becas Ayuda a la movilidad,</u> Procedimiento de Desplazamientos del Servicio de Dirección de Personas 	management of travel insurance and travel management (hotels, transportation, etc.). - Marie Curie - Marie Curie
30. Access to career advice	+/-	 Institutional Process: Servicio de Gestión de Investigación Escuela de Doctorado Unidad de Bibliometría 	Almost but not fully implemented There is a multitude of information on the web but it is scattered. The University's Bibliometrics Service offers advice on the development of a research career. However, the "Mentoring Procedure" for researchers has not been developed. The Bibliometrics Unit offers advice to researchers on their research career. There are several services that advise researchers in their professional career. We can highlight: Research Management Service, Doctorate School, Bibliometrics Unit Recommendations made by the working group: Develop a "Mentoring Procedure". Improve the web map by making the University of Navarra's offer of research career counselling more visible and accessible.
31. Intellectual Property Rights	+/-	 NATIONAL LEGISLATION Real Decreto Legislativo 1/1996, de 12 de abril, por el que se aprueba el texto refundido de la Ley de Propiedad Intelectual, regularizando, aclarando y 	Almost but not fully implemented It is worth noting that the University of Navarra has a norm covering intellectual and industrial property and a special UNIT at the Technology Transfer Office supporting IP issue. The Head of the department is also a Senior IP advisor at the European IP

		 armonizando las disposiciones legales vigentes sobre la materia. Normativa española en materia de Propiedad Intelectual. Institutional Process Normativa y procedimientos sobre Propiedad industrial e Intelectual universidad de Navarra 	Helpdesk.Intellectual and Industrial Protection at UNAV:https://www.unav.edu/en/web/investigacion/proteccion-y-promocion-de-resultadoshttp://www.iprhelpdesk.eu/ambassadorsteam#spainThere are numerous internal regulations on intellectual property,although it has been found that it is sometimes not easilylocatable, may be outdated and is sometimes not translated.Recommendations made by the working group:Collect all the regulations, check that they are up to date andtranslated into English. Make the documentation relating toIntellectual Property regulations easily localizable on the web.
32. Co-authorship	-	 NATIONAL LEGISLATION Real Decreto Legislativo 1/1996, de 12 de abril, por el que se aprueba el texto refundido de la Ley de Propiedad Intelectual, regularizando, aclarando y armonizando las disposiciones legales vigentes sobre la materia. Normativa española en materia de Propiedad Intelectual. Institutional Process 	 -Insufficiently implemented Co-authorship is promoted among the research staff but this is made on an informal basis. It is necessary to promote it in a more institutionalized way at different levels. Recommendations made by the working group: Create a procedure for Co-directing doctoral theses in the Doctoral School. This aspect will be dealt with in a specific way in "The Handbook of Good Practices" (co-authorship in papers, calls for research proposals in which co-direction is possible and participation in other publications).

		 Normativa y procedimientos sobre <u>Propiedad industrial e Intelectual</u> <u>universidad de Navarra</u> 	
33. Teaching	+	LEGISLATION	+ Fully implemented
		 <u>R.D. 103/2019, Estatuto del Personal</u> <u>Predoctoral</u> Institutional Process: 	In application of the R.D 103/2019, the University of Navarra favors the teaching activity of Predoctoral Staff, who may collaborate in teaching up to 60 hours per year and a maximum of 180 hours during the extension of the Predoctoral contract.
		 <u>Normativa del profesorado.</u> <u>Criterios sobre las colaboraciones</u> <u>docentes del personal investigador</u> Normativa Profesor colaborador y 	The University of Navarra also has a set of regulations for teaching staff (<u>Normativa del profesorado.</u>)
		colaborador docente	For staff who are not contracted for activities not directly related to teaching (including research staff), there is the possibility of appointments as Collaborating Professor and Teaching Collaborator, which allow collaboration in teaching with a limit of hours.
			For research staff, there are some criteria for teaching collaborations of research staff: <u>Criterios sobre las colaboraciones</u> <u>docentes del personal investigador</u>
34. Complains/	-		-Insuffiently implemented
appeals			There is no specific procedure. It is necessary to review current policies to define procedures and ensure that adequate support is

			provided to personnel in conflict situations.
			Recommendations made by the working group: An internal procedure will be developed, detailing conflict management, as well as the staff and departments involved in the management of the different types of conflict.
35. Participation in decision- making bodies	+	 Institutional Process: Estatutos Normativa de las juntas directivas de los centros académicos Normativa de funcionamiento de las juntas departamentales Normativa general sobre la gestión los centros de investigación Normativa sobre grupos de investigación Convenio entre la Universidad de Navarra y la ANECA para la evaluación 	+ Fully implemented The University of Navarra has its own Statutes (<u>Estatutos</u>). It also has Regulations on the Governance and Management of (Research) <u>Centres</u> and Research Groups (<u>Grupos de</u> <u>Investigación</u>)
		de la actividad investigadora de los profesores contratados permanentes	
		Training and Develop	
36. Relation with	-		Insufficiently implemented
supervisors			There is no internal regulation nor guidelines regulating the

			relationship with the supervisors Recommendations made by the working group:
			Draw up a guide regulating the relationship between supervisors and researchers.
37. Supervision and managerial duties	-		Insufficiently implemented There is neither internal regulation nor guidelines regulating the relationship with the supervisors.
			Recommendations made by the working group:
			Draw up a guide regulating the relationship between supervisors and researchers.
38. Continuing Professional	+/-	Institutional Process:	Almost but not fully implemented
Development		- Unidad de Bibliometría	The University of Navarra offers researchers, through the
		 <u>Servicio de Gestión de la Investigación</u> <u>Servicio de Dirección de Personas</u> Beneficios sociales (Portal del Empleado) 	Bibliometrics Unit, a menu of services (<u>carta de servicios</u>), including advice and training during their professional careers.

			 the Employee Portal. The Internal Communication area, through the <u>UNCLIC</u>, publishes seminars and news of interest to research staff. Although multiple training initiatives for the research staff are managed in different areas, sometimes they are not easily accessible or lack significant continuity Recommendations made by the working group: Prepare an annual "Training Plan" for the research staff in which training activities for each academic year are scheduled.
39. Access to research training and continuous development	+/-	 NORMATIVA INTERNA Unidad de Bibliometría Servicio de Gestión de la Investigación Servicio de Dirección de Personas Beneficios sociales (Portal del Empleado) 	Almost but not fully implemented The University of Navarra offers researchers, through the Bibliometrics Unit, a menu of services, including advice and training during their professional careers. Likewise, the Research Management Service offers training, computer sessions on calls and collaboration opportunities through its Monthly Bulletin. The People Management Service offers through the employee portal a letter of training activities addressed to all interested employees. All employees of the University of Navarra are entitled to discounts on their official registration fees: Bachelor's, Master's, Language and Doctorate studies. These discounts are published in the Employee Portal.

		The Internal Communication area, through the UNCLIC, publishes seminars and news of interest to research staff.
		There is no established a procedure guaranteeing that all suggestions made for training actions are considered.
		Recommendations made by the working group:
		It is necessary to establish an annual evaluation system within the "Training Plan", aimed at research staff, ensuring that all suggestions for training actions are heard and considered, even if they are specific and do not concern larger groups.
40. Supervision	-	-Insufficiently implemented
40. Supervision	-	-Insufficiently implemented There is no internal regulation that governing supervision.
40. Supervision	-	
40. Supervision	-	There is no internal regulation that governing supervision.
40. Supervision Any additional issues	-	There is no internal regulation that governing supervision. Recommendations made by the working group: Draw up a guide regulating the relationship between supervisors
	-	There is no internal regulation that governing supervision. Recommendations made by the working group: Draw up a guide regulating the relationship between supervisors

Template 1 – Annex: Open, Transparent and Merit-based Recruitment Check-list¹

OTM-R checklist for organisations

OTM-R checklist for organisations					
	Open	Trans- parent	Merit- based	Answer: ++ Yes, completely +/-Yes, substantially -/+ Yes, partially No	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
OTM-R system					
 Have we published a version of our OTM-R policy online (in the national language and in English)? 	x	x	×	++ Yes, completely	To be developed and published. <u>HRS4R Universidad</u> <u>de Navarra.</u>
2. Do we have an internal guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and practices for all types of positions?	x	x	X	+/-Yes, substantially	Selection and Recruitment Procedures. There is an internal recruitment procedure. This procedure consists of a selection process launch sheet (application) and the recruitment approval sheet (approval). For each category and professional group there is a job description with general entry requirements that are specified in the offers for each position (specific requirements) and salary tables that allow for fairness.
3. Is everyone involved in the process sufficiently trained in the area of OTM-R?	X	X	x	+/-Yes, substantially	Selection and Recruitment Procedures Existence of training programs for OTM-R: From Human Resources, training and personal coaching sessions have been carried out for those employees who are or may be involved in the evaluation of employees. There are no specific training programs in the area of OTM-R. Six people from different areas are involved in the recruitment, selection and hiring process. Each person has the function of evaluating the candidates from a technical, professional, competitive and institutional perspective. - Number of staff following training in OTM-R: The selection area is responsible for coordinating training in OTM-R. The HR Manager for Research is responsible for compliance with the OTM-R process

¹ <u>http://ec.europa.eu/euraxess/index.cfm/services/researchPolicies</u>

4. Do we make (sufficient) use of e-recruitment tools?	x	x		-/+ Yes, partially	Creation of a section in the institutional website in which vacancies are posted. Web-based tool for (all) the stages in the recruitment process: All offers are published on the University's website (www.unav.es). Depending on the type of position and profile, specific webjobs are used (Euraxess, Navarre Employment Service, Infojobs, etc).
5. Do we have a quality control system for OTM-R in place?	x	x	x	+/-Yes, substantially	Selection and Recruitment Procedures. The selection and contracting procedure establishes milestones and phases in selection and contracting. Each candidate has to be evaluated by at least three people and each recruitment has to be approved by three other people. This is why the same procedure for approving the selection and contracting serves as a monitoring and contracting control. The person in charge of Human Resources for Research ensures correct compliance at all stages.
6. Does our current OTM-R policy encourage external candidates to apply?	x	x	x	-/+ Yes, partially	Creation of a section in the institutional website in which vacancies are posted. Selection and Recruitment Procedure. Trend in the share of applicants from outside the organization: Although the University of Navarra publishes all offers on the website. It is necessary, on the one hand, to make these offers more visible on the University's website and, on the other hand, to make greater use of external websites.
7. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract researchers from abroad?	x	x	x	-/+ Yes, partially	Promote the use of employment websites and develop procedures to attract international talent. Selection and Recruitment Procedure. Trend in the share of applicants from abroad: The international projects area uses websites to attract international talent, especially EURAXESS. However, there is a need to promote and give greater visibility to the offers at international level.
8. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract underrepresented groups?	x	x	x	+/-Yes, substantially	Promote the use of employment websites and develop procedures to attract underrepresented

					researchers. Selection and Recruitment Procedure. Trend in the share of applicants among underrepresented groups (frequently women) : The University of Navarra applies the Spanish legislation on equal opportunities between men and women in its selection processes without discrimination. The application of Spanish legislation and the University's own philosophy means that candidates are not discriminated against in the selection processes, and that all are in equal conditions. In addition, the University of Navarra started the application of the General Law on Disability, ensuring compliance with it. However, there is no explicit document on guidelines. For this reason, the University of Navarra intends to incorporate them into the Selection and Contracting Procedure.
9. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to provide attractive working conditions for researchers?	x	X	X	++ Yes, completely	No further action required Trend in the share of applicants from outside the organization: The University of Navarra has a Professional Development Program for Researchers (PDPI). For each of the categories of the research career, there are entrance requirements and salary tables. Likewise, the University of Navarra has a package of social benefits (a bonus for studies, medical insurance, family aid, a marriage prize, a birth prize, permanence allowance, etc.).
10. Do we have means to monitor whether the most suitable researchers apply?				+/-Yes, substantially	Selection and Recruitment Procedure. The call for evaluation in the Professional Development Program for Researchers will be made annually. Likewise, a follow-up report of the doctoral thesis is prepared annually for the pre-doctoral staff. For technical staff, annual objectives are set that are evaluated the following year within the Professional Development Program for Technical and Research Support Staff.

Advertising and application phase					
11. Do we have clear guidelines or templates (e.g., EURAXESS) for advertising positions?	x	x		-/+ Yes, partially	Selection and Recruitment Procedure. Encourage the use of specific employment websites for researchers. There is an internal template for launching the selection process. However, there is no guide for the publication of offers.
12. Do we include in the job advertisement references/links to all the elements foreseen in the relevant section of the toolkit? [<i>see Chapter 4.4.1 a</i>) of the OTM-R expert report ²]	x	x		No	Create a template for publication of vacancies and include it in the Selection and Recruitment Procedure. The job offers are published with all the information about the institution, the position, the conditions and the reference to the project.
13. Do we make full use of EURAXESS to ensure our research vacancies reach a wider audience?	x	x		-/+ Yes, partially	Encourage the use of employment websites aimed at attracting international talent, especially EURAXESS. Selection and Recruitment Procedure. The share of job adverts posted on EURAXESS; The international projects area uses websites to attract international talent, especially EURAXESS. However, there is a need to promote and give greater visibility to the offers at international level Trend in the share of applicants recruited from outside the organisation/abroad
14. Do we make use of other job advertising tools?	x	x		+/-Yes, substantially	Promote the use of employment websites and develop procedures to attract international talent. All offers are published on the University's website (www.unav.es). Depending on the type of position and profile, specific webjobs are used (Euraxess, Navarre Employment Service, Infojobs, etc).
15. Do we keep the administrative burden to a minimum for the candidate? [<i>see Chapter 4.4.1 b</i>] ⁴⁵]	x			++ Yes, completely	No further action required The candidate must send his cv to the e-mail address provided in the offer.
Selection and evaluation phase					
16. Do we have clear rules governing the appointment of selection committees? [<i>see Chapter 4.4.2 a</i>) ⁴⁵]		x	x	++ Yes, completely	Appointment of the Recruitment Committee. Contract Sheet. Statistics on the composition of panels: The Selection Committee consists of three

² <u>http://ec.europa.eu/euraxess/index.cfm/services/researchPolicies</u>

				people: Principal Investigator, Department Director and Head of Research Human Resources. They are the ones who interview and validate the candidates from the technical, professional, and competence point of view. Once the final candidate has been selected, his or her recruitment must also be approved by Project Manager, Faculty or Centre Manager and Director of the Research Management Service.
17. Do we have clear rules concerning the composition of selection committees?	x	x	++ Yes, completely	Recruitment Committee. Approval of Contract Sheet. . Written guidelines: The selection committee is made up of a Principal Investigator, a Department Director and a Research Human Resources Manager. Exceptionally, when there is no consensus in this committee, evaluation is requested from another department.
18. Are the committees sufficiently gender-balanced?	x	x	++ Yes, completely	No further action required. The selection committees are made up of men and women and are sufficiently equitable.
19. Do we have clear guidelines for selection committees which help to judge 'merit' in a way that leads to the best candidate being selected?		X	+/-Yes, substantially	Template for launching for the recruitment process. Include in the Selection and Recruitment sheet the competences required, competences evaluated and performance of the candidate. Written guidelines: The PDP-I and the PDP provide job descriptions for each category as well as the minimum requirements for access to each category. The bibliometrics unit also conducts CV studies of some candidates.
Appointment phase				
20. Do we inform all applicants at the end of the selection process?	x		-/+ Yes, partially	Selection and Recruitment Procedure. There is no direct, official communication. The aim is to work on improving communication with candidates in our selection processes.
21. Do we provide adequate feedback to interviewees?	x		-/+ Yes, partially	Selection and Recruitment Procedures. There is no direct, official communication. The aim is to work on improving communication with candidates in our selection processes.

22. Do we have an appropriate complaints mechanism in place?	x	-/+ Yes, partially	Dispute settlement procedure, Statistics on complaints: There is no direct, official communication. The aim is to work on improving communication with candidates in our selection processes.
Overall assessment			
23. Do we have a system in place to assess whether OTM- R delivers on its objectives?		+/-Yes, substantially	Selection and Recruitment Procedures. The selection and contracting process allows us to monitor each of the phases and assess the fulfilment of the objective of each one of them.